

WORKSHOP

Operationalising an EU Approach to Research and Innovation for Sustainable Agriculture and Food and Nutrition security: Drawing on lessons learned

**Brussels, 7 November 2014
The Square, Hall 400**

INTRODUCTION

During 2014 the European Commission Directorate General International Cooperation and Development, (DEVCO) redefined its approach to agricultural research and innovation for development (AR4D). AR4D is essential to addressing the major challenges of poverty, hunger and under-nutrition, and as these challenges are concentrated in developing countries, there is a clear rationale for supporting AR4D from development budgets. Development investment is justified, however, only if there are clear links to impact, particularly on the poor: both the producers, the majority of whom are smallholder farmers, and the consumers who need to access food at affordable prices. While addressing current challenges requires high quality science, partnerships to take the results through the last mile to impact are equally essential.

A workshop was held on 7th November, following the meetings of the CGIAR Fund Council and Funders Forum that were hosted by the European Commission. This workshop brought together CGIAR stakeholders with representatives of the European and African research communities and the relevant Commission services for a mutual interchange of views and perspectives. The workshop was attended by more than 60 participants including donors from Europe and elsewhere, researchers and Commission officials from DEVCO, AGRI and RTD. DEVCO's new approach paper was presented and EU experience was showcased around its four pillars:

- i. Ensuring the success of global and regional AR4D initiatives,
- ii. Improving European leadership, coordination and influence,
- iii. Exploring new strategic directions to put research into use and achieve impact,
- iv. Ensuring that AR4D delivers impact at country and local level.

Building on the CGIAR meetings, the workshop wrapped up with a panel discussion framed around the question of 'How is CGIAR responding to key EU development policy objectives of poverty reduction and food and nutrition security in developing countries?'

The detailed agenda of the meeting is presented in Annex 1. The presentations are accessible in the link <http://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/hunger-foodsecurity-nutrition/blog/workshop-operationalising-eu-approach-research-and-innovation-sustainable-agriculture-and-food->.DEVCO's Approach paper is at https://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/sites/devco/files/guide-approach-paper-ar4d-2014_en_0.pdf.

HIGHLIGHTS

The workshop clearly demonstrated that:

- DEVCO has a balanced portfolio of support for AR4D that includes research governance, strategic research and research at the delivery end.
- Collectively, our research is leading to substantial impact on the livelihoods of our main target group – poor smallholder farmers in developing countries.
- There is strong complementarity and synergy between AR4D supported by DEVCO and research and innovation supported by the Directorates General RTD and AGRI through Horizon 2020.

- There is potential to further scale up successes, to address research gaps, and to strengthen the linkages between research and country development programmes. Innovation Platforms (led by FARA) and joint initiatives with the private sector (presented by ICRAF) are clear cases with scaling-up potential.
- CGIAR has increasing relevance as a research partner for DEVCO, having adopted a Strategy and Results Framework geared to development outcomes, and currently finalising impact pathways with measurable indicators and targets.
- Part of the CGIAR's strength is its ability to form partnerships with regional and national organisations, exploiting its comparative advantage to maximise the impact of AR4D.

SESSION 1: INTRODUCTORY

Roberto Ridolfi, DEVCO's Director for Sustainable Growth and Development, opened the workshop and explained how it is structured. He reminded the participants that Europe is the largest regional donor to agricultural research for development, as well as being a source of expertise in the implementation of research and innovation. Between 2007 and 2014, the European Commission (DEVCO's) spending on agricultural research, extension and innovation for development averaged 80 million Euros per year and a similar level of commitment is expected in the current budget period. He finished by stressing that research paid for through the development budget must lead to impact, particularly for the poor smallholder farmers whose livelihoods still largely depend on agriculture. Going the last mile, or the last inch, to reach these beneficiaries is crucial and is often the most challenging part.

Director Ridolfi also highlighted the European launch of the book 'Maximising Impact from Agricultural Research: Potential of the IAR4D Concept' based on experience from the CGIAR/FARA Sub-Saharan Africa Challenge Programme, co-financed by the EU, to take place later in the workshop.

Patrik Kolar, Head of Unit 'Agri-Food Chain' in the Bio-economy Directorate of RTD (Research and Innovation), briefly presented RTD and how the research framework programme 'Horizon 2020' is structured. This is much larger than DEVCO's support to AR4D but is complementary to it, now pursuing a similar concept of multi-actor approaches but with an overall focus on its contribution for Europe. There is good collaboration between DG RTD and other Directorates of the European Commission, including DG DEVCO in the programming of Horizon 2020 and the selection of research topics.

Bernard Rey, Deputy Head of Unit 'Rural Development, Food Security and Nutrition', presented the DEVCO Approach Paper on Research and Innovation that guided the structure of the workshop. He outlined the EU development policy priorities in the areas of sustainable agriculture, agriculture for growth, food and nutrition security and resilience. He emphasised the importance of building on the lessons learned from DEVCO's support to AR4D so far, and the increased emphasis in the new approach paper on putting research into use. There is also scope for improving the links between research that is managed from Brussels and the development programmes managed by EU offices in developing countries.

Hans-Jörg Lutzeyer, of the RTD Agri-Food Chain Unit then elaborated in more detail on Horizon 2020 and in particular on its Societal Challenge 2 *'Food Security, Sustainable*

Agriculture, Marine and Maritime and inland water research and the bio-economy, which is co-managed by DG AGRI (Directorate General for Agriculture and Rural Development). He stated that less developed countries, including African countries, are automatically eligible to be included in proposals for funding under Horizon 2020, and that there are opportunities around the 'sustainable agriculture' topic and the 'small farms – global markets' topics in the 2014 and 2015 work programmes respectively. The work programme from 2016 is being developed and there may be potential opportunities for closer links with the operational plans of FARA and the sub-regional organisations, and for follow-up of the road map resulting from the High Level Policy Dialogue between the African Union and the EU. CGIAR is also eligible and CGIAR centres received approximately 5 million Euros through Framework Programme 7, which was the precursor to Horizon 2020.

SESSION 2: GLOBAL AND REGIONAL INITIATIVES

At the global level, the CGIAR is the major international public sector agricultural research initiative focused on the needs of developing countries, while GFAR (Global Forum for Agricultural Research) engages stakeholder and regional constituencies in the international agricultural research agenda, while coordinating global foresight and facilitating partnerships and capacity building. In Africa, the Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme (CAADP) process provides a framework for focusing investment to promote growth and development in the agricultural sector. FARA (Forum for Agricultural Research in Africa) and its associated sub-regional research organisations all have medium-term operational plans which support the CAADP process in the areas of research, extension and innovation. By channelling support to these global and regional initiatives, DEVCO contributes to their success as well as to donor harmonisation and management efficiency.

This session draws on two examples of support to global initiatives: the Generation Challenge Programme (GCP) as an example of a successful CGIAR programme supported by several donors, and GFAR, where EU support is based on a medium-term plan covering the period 2014–18. The EU is the leading donor to both the GCP and GFAR.

An external evaluation of the GCP was carried out in 2013 – the first major programme evaluation carried out by the CGIAR Independent Evaluation Arrangement (IEA). **Jonathan Robinson**, a consultant for IEA, described the results. The GCP is a ten year programme ending in 2014. Total funding is USD168m, 34% of which is from the EU. It has focused on the identification of genes conveying resistance to abiotic stresses, such as drought and deficiency in nutrients such as phosphorus, salinity tolerance, aluminium tolerance etc. and in developing varieties with these specific traits in key staple crops. An integrated breeding platform has been established as a resource for plant breeders. The evaluation rated the programme as being highly satisfactory or satisfactory against ROM (results-oriented monitoring) criteria. Improved varietal lines have been incorporated into commodity based CGIAR Research Programmes (CRPs) for further development and the integrated breeding platform will be maintained through grant funding from the Gates Foundation. The international network of plant scientists, involving around 180 partner institutions globally, is an important output of the programme.

Mark Holderness described how GFAR brings the voices of stakeholders, including farmers, NGOs, the private sector and regional representatives, to the arena where research priorities are negotiated. Through its convening role GFAR catalyses the partnerships that are necessary for research carried out by CGIAR and others to achieve impact. The GCARD

(Global Conference on Agricultural Research for Development) process is a key instrument for engaging stakeholders in CGIAR research and 'GCARD3', which is scheduled for launch in November, will be closely aligned with the process of developing the new CGIAR Strategy and Results Framework and the new round of CRPs to take effect from 2016. GFAR supports important initiatives to promote gender and youth in agriculture and farmers' rights, and plays an important role in foresight and in knowledge management and connectivity, linking also with DG AGRI, DG RTD and DG Connect. Mark drew attention to the increasing disparity between the resources directed to the CGIAR and to national agricultural research national agricultural research. Funding to national systems had only increased by an average of 20% at a time when funding to the CGIAR had doubled. He introduced the Integrated Innovation Investment Facility (IIIF) that GFAR is currently developing jointly with IFAD, as a coherent large-scale mechanism for directing more support to National Agricultural Innovation Systems and linking multilateral investments with bilateral development programmes. The focus of the Facility is on putting research into use and addressing key capacity needs in the complex pathways to impact, to ensure that the intended clients of agricultural research and innovation are able to benefit from such investments.

GCP is an example of the strategic upstream research that is necessary to generate the products that enable farmers to strengthen their resilience and adapt to new challenges, such as climate change. GFAR helps to ensure that research is on the right track in addressing stakeholder priorities and meeting farmer needs. Without EU support, the outputs and potential impact of both of these initiatives would have been greatly reduced.

SESSION 3: IMPROVING EUROPEAN COORDINATION

Europe is the biggest regional donor to the rural development and agriculture sector, to agricultural research for development and to the CGIAR, as well as being a source of agricultural research expertise. Within the European Commission, different Directorates General manage financial instruments with different, but often complementary, objectives. There are obvious advantages in greater coherence across Europe to ensure that the totality of efforts is greater than the sum of individual initiatives.

This session examined two models of coordination, which are themselves complementary. The European Initiative for Agricultural Research for Development (EIARD) is a grouping of European donors to AR4D, and the High Level Policy Dialogue (HLPD), which is a mechanism jointly implemented by the EU and the African Union.

Jürgen Anthofer of the RTD Agri-Food Chain Unit and Executive Secretary of EIARD provided a brief overview on EIARD's recent activities and impact. EIARD is a permanent informal European donor coordination platform between the EC, EU Member States, Norway and Switzerland aiming at harmonising policies and investments for agricultural research for development, endorsed by the European Council and Parliament. The Commission is holding the permanent Vice Chair (DG DEVCO) and the Secretariat is hosted by DG RTD. EIARD recently had its 20th annual 'European Coordination Group' (ECG) Meeting in Dublin. While implementing its 2014–18 Strategic Plan with five strategic outputs a major work stream is the coordinated support to the CGIAR, to which European public donors contributed USD404 million in 2013. In recognition of high investments to the CGIAR Fund (USD306 million), Europe has been granted 7 Fund Council seats. EIARD is used as the European coordination mechanism in order to prepare joint European positions for Fund Council Meetings, ensuring coordinated visibility and recognition of the European voices. EIARD has also been instrumental in

launching a joint working group with SCAR, the Standing Committee on Agricultural Research, named ARCH (Agricultural Research towards greater Impact on Global Challenges). It aims to work on the interface and towards linkages between agricultural research in Europe and agricultural research for development. Jürgen also reported on the very positive outcome of an independent review commissioned by DG DEVCO earlier this year, which investigated EIARD's role in contributing to the 3Cs – coordination, coherence and complementarity.

Nienke Buisman of DG RTD International Directorate described the EU-AU High Level Policy Dialogue on Science, Technology and Innovation (HLPD), which is a joint initiative of the EU (Commission and Member States) and the AU. On the European side, it is led by the International Directorate of DG RTD and, on the African side, by the President of AMCOST, Congo Brazzaville. In 2013, the senior officials at their HLPD meeting adopted the subject of 'the role of STI in promoting Food and Nutrition Security and sustainable agriculture' as its priority area of focus for the coming three years. An expert working group has been set up to develop a detailed input to a roadmap to concretely define the scope of an EU-Africa Research and Innovation partnership and to outline the next steps in taking it forward.

Philippe Petithuguenin (CIRAD), who co-chairs the group that includes a balance of European and Africa experts, outlined its input to the HLPD road map. This is currently in final draft form and will soon be sent out for broader consultation. The road map proposes priorities related to sustainable intensification, agriculture and food systems for nutrition, and expansion and improvement of agricultural markets and trade. It is linked to the Joint Africa-EU strategy and is expected to inform programming of Horizon 2020 and DEVCO instruments in the next few years.

EIARD and HLPD provide evidence that coordination on AR4D is working at European level and at the cross-regional level, increasing confidence that strategies and programmes will be coherent.

SESSION 4: NEW STRATEGIC DIRECTIONS FOR PUTTING RESEARCH INTO USE

It is essential that the products of research are appropriate to the needs of users, and that they are able to access them and have the capacity to use them effectively. By its nature, research is risky and not all programmes can be expected to deliver exactly what is predicted. However, the outputs that are proven to be effective should be applied so as to maximise their adoption and impact. This session includes presentations by the EU (DG AGRI), the NGO ETC Foundation, the World Agroforestry Centre, and FARA (Forum for Agricultural Research in Africa) to illustrate approaches for getting research results adopted. Effective partnerships – with farmers, private sector and NGOs – are central to the success of these case studies.

Rob Peters of DG AGRI described the European Innovation Partnership (EIP) as a new initiative intended to better link farmers, advisors, business and other actors to implement concrete innovation projects in operational groups. EIP is funded under the EU Common Agricultural Policy but operational groups are intended to link with research projects funded under Horizon 2020. European experience has demonstrated the need for the active involvement of farmers and other economic operators in the agri-food sector. The Agricultural Knowledge and Information System (AKIS) is intended to support this effort.

Ann Waters-Bayer of ETC Foundation in the Netherlands presented lessons learnt during the JOLISAA (Joint Learning in Innovation Systems in African Agriculture) project funded by the Framework Programme of EU/RTD and the continuing work of the Prolinnova (Promoting Local Innovation in ecologically oriented agriculture and natural resource management) network supported by EU/DEVCO through GFAR. Prolinnova is a CSO-initiated Global Partnership Programme of the GFAR and promotes farmer-led participatory research and innovation. These initiatives explore innovation processes in rural communities and how these processes and their outcomes are not always predictable. Endogenous innovation in the 'social wild' can be supported by external knowledge gleaned through research, provided that research understands the social and organisational dimensions and is geared to the particular context. Poor farmers and rural communities typically engage in multiple value chains to minimise risks but research should look beyond value chains to livelihood systems. Partnerships must be brokered between diverse actors in understanding complex systems and directing research accordingly. The Prolinnova network is currently working with the CRPs on Aquatic Agricultural Systems and Climate Change, Agriculture and Food Security to integrate such approaches in these programmes. A plea was made for long-term flexible funding to support such experimental approaches.

Tony Simons, Director General of the World Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF – a CGIAR centre) focused on working with the private sector. He pointed out that, while flows of overseas development assistance to developing countries are relatively flat, flows from the private sector are increasing. There are opportunities to harness some of this funding in research and innovation initiatives that benefit smallholder farmers, poor rural communities and the environment. Tony went on to illustrate this point through several case studies. The Novella Partnership is supported by EU funding. ICRAF is working with Unilever, NGOs and local companies to support farmers in developing and marketing *Allanblackia* as a healthier substitute for palm oil. Rural resource centres have been established to make inputs available to farmers and provide the necessary skills training, and *Allanblackia*-based margarine has just entered the market in Tanzania. Further success stories come from cooperation with Mars in rehabilitating cocoa development through the Sustainable Cocoa Initiative in Côte D'Ivoire, and through the African Orphan Crops Consortium designed to support DNA sequencing of 101 key underutilised crops with nutritional potential and to develop nutrient rich products. A key conclusion is that partnerships with the private sector are essential in testing the development hypothesis so that research can be guided accordingly, as well as in scaling up the development of research products to maximise impact.

FARA is leading the CGIAR Sub-Saharan Africa Challenge Programme (SSA-CP). **Yemi Akinbamijo**, the Executive Director of FARA, presented the programme and its achievements. SSA-CP has adopted the integrated agricultural research for development (IAR4D) approach, which is based on innovation platforms that bring together farmers, researchers, private sector and governmental and non-governmental actors to generate innovation linked to particular opportunities on value chains. SSA-CP has completed a proof on concept that demonstrates that IAR4D works, and is more effective in generating benefits than conventional research and development approaches. Highlights of the analysis show that individuals participating in platforms attained an average income of USD1362 per year, 231% above the baseline figure of USD588 per year. Gender-disaggregated data showed that women increased their income by an average of 326%, and tens of thousands of farm households benefitted from the programme, also beyond the IAR4D pilot areas. The success of the IAR4D approach in its pilot areas in western, central and southern Africa has prompted more widespread adoption by African governments, donor projects and NGOs, and the IAR4D

approach is being integrated into the work of the three system-based CRPs (Dryland, Humidtropics and Aquatic Agricultural Systems).

The session ended with a formal European launch of the book 'Maximising Impact from Agricultural Research: Potential of the IAR4D Concept', at which copies of the book were presented to **David Radcliffe**, the senior policy officer responsible for EU support to the programme, and **Frank Rijsberman**, the CEO of the CGIAR Consortium Office.

This was an exciting session of the workshop – showing how EU support to AR4D is achieving real impact on the lives of farmers and how we are supporting innovative approaches with NGOs and the private sector to travel the last mile highlighted by Director Ridolfi. SSA-CP stands out as a success story of partnerships delivering impact and this programme would not have been able to prove its concept and scale up activities without the support of the EU. There may be potential for the EIP, which is in its initial stages, to learn from some of this experience.

SESSION 5: LINKING WITH NATIONAL SYSTEMS AND COUNTRY PROGRAMMES

Although it may have a global scope, AR4D needs to deliver impact at national level and below. However, in the EU and many other donor agencies, global and regional research programmes are managed centrally while development programmes are more typically national in scope and managed by country offices. NARS are often under-resourced with weak capacity. Strengthening research capacity at national level and strengthening links between research and development are key processes in building pathways to research impact.

CORAF/WECARD is the sub-regional research organisation covering west and central Africa. The Executive Director, **Harold Roy-Macaulay** described the scope of CORAF/WECARD's work and its particular support to the NARS in the region. CORAF/WECARD supports the NARS in its 22 member states through coordinating and facilitating their involvement in the implementation of research for development, capacity building, knowledge management by making knowledge generated through research available to its clients according to their needs, and advocacy by making resources available for NARS to participate in regional research projects and influencing regional and national policies to facilitate research for development. While most of CORAF/WECARD's funds are tendered competitively, some research is directly commissioned, which allows the weaker NARS to be targeted. In addition to direct donor funding CORAF/WECARD is supported by the West Africa Agricultural Productivity Programme (WAAPP – countries funding facilitated by the World Bank), which helps align CORAF/WECARD's regional activities in its response to national priorities, through the establishment of innovation platforms. CORAF/WECARD also led the implementation of the SSA-CP programme in West Africa and in particular in the Kano-Katsina-Maradi pilot site, and is involved in institutionalising the IAR4D approach in a region where there is high demand for it. The Organisation is also establishing regional centres of excellence, based on specific commodities that can support NARS.

The EU was the third largest supporter of the CORAF/WECARD 2008-13 Medium Term Operational Plan (behind the WAAPP-country contributions facilitated by the World Bank, and DFID).

EU support to AR4D at the country level is most active in Kenya and there are strong linkages with regional work through ICIPE. A presentation is included in the workshop documentation, but was not presented due to lack of time.

PANEL ON CGIAR

Following the above presentations, the workshop took advantage of the many CGIAR stakeholders present for a discussion on how well the CGIAR is responding to EU development policy priorities and to garner CGIAR views of their role in the wider agenda of agricultural research for development. The discussion was moderated by **Philippe Petithuguenin** (CIRAD).

Frank Rijsberman (CGIAR Consortium Office) stressed that the new CGIAR is orientated towards development goals, which is a change from the previous exclusive focus on public goods. The Consortium is currently leading the process of defining intermediate development objectives on the pathways between research and impact. All programmes contribute to development outcomes but the impact pathways of some of the system programmes are more complex. Researchers must work with partners to deliver outcomes.

While welcoming the increased development focus of the CGIAR, **Maggie Gill** (CGIAR Independent Science and Partnership Council) pointed out that CGIAR's reputation still also depends on scientific excellence, evidenced by published papers. She reinforced Frank's comments on the importance of well-defined impact pathways backed by robust theories of change. In terms of partnerships, it is important to identify where the CGIAR can add value, to initiatives such as Prolinnova, for example. With respect to the increasing importance of research addressing nutrition outcomes, she thought the CGIAR could contribute understanding of the complex pathways between agriculture and nutrition and thereby enhance the potential contribution of AR4D to nutrition outcomes. As a separate point, she emphasised that there could be lessons to be learned by the CGIAR from how the EU coordinates agricultural research through such programmes as Horizon 2020.

Mark Holderness (GFAR) agreed that CGIAR needed to harness its comparative advantage to ensure that research leads to development outcomes. Outsiders should see CGIAR as a partner rather than a competitor in taking forward the international agricultural research agenda and the CGIAR need not always be in the lead. African organisations have taken a strong lead on the African Climate Smart Alliance, for example. Innovative partnerships with public private, civil and producer organizations open up issues to broader thinking, driven by country needs and examine where CGIAR can best add value to these. Increased and integrated support is needed for National Agricultural Innovation Systems, particularly in the poorest countries, to level the playing field for creative partnerships to be established.

Jonathan Wadsworth (CGIAR Fund Office) mentioned the good working relationships between CGIAR and African research organisations such as FARA and CORAF/WECARD and appreciated the balance of EU funding to CGIAR and African organisations. He noted that Europe was the largest contributor to the CGIAR Fund, and the strong influence of EIARD, leading to specially created incentive seats on the Fund Council to accommodate strong European support to the unrestricted windows of the Fund. He agreed that funding to NARS is not growing at the same rate as that to the CGIAR. Donors need to step up

support to NARS in a strategic way, including through building links with CGIAR programmes, and avoid a proliferation of small bilateral projects.

Bernard Rey (DEVCO) closed the meeting, thanking all the participants for the stimulating presentations and interesting discussions.

Annex 1

PROGRAMME

Session	Topics	Key Presenters
08:30	Registration and Welcome coffee	
Session 1: Introductory 09.00 – 10.00	Welcome and Introductory remarks Presentations of DEVCO Approach Paper Horizon 2020 (Framework Programme of DG Research and Innovation)	Roberto Ridolfi, DG DEVCO Patrik Kolar, DG RTD Bernard Rey, DEVCO Hans-Jörg Lutzeyer, RTD
10.00	Coffee	
Session 2. Support to global and regional initiatives 10.30 – 11.45	Generation Challenge Programme (CGIAR) GFAR Discussion	Jonathan Robinson, IEA Mark Holderness, GFAR
Session 3. Improving European coordination 11.45 – 12.30.	EIARD High Level Policy Dialogue on STI Discussion	Jürgen Anthofer, RTD Nienke Buisman, RTD Philippe Petithuguenin, CIRAD
12.30 – 13.30	Light lunch	

Session 4. New strategic directions for putting research into use 13.30 – 15.15	European Innovation Partnership	Rob Peters, DG AGRI
	JOLISAA (FP7 Project)	Ann Waters-Bayer, ETC
	Private sector experience	Tony Simons, ICRAF
	Sub-Saharan Africa Challenge Programme	Yemi Akinbamijo, FARA
	Discussion	
15.15 – 15.30 Book launch	Maximising Impact from Agricultural Research: Potential of the IAR4D Concept	FARA
15.30- 15.45	Coffee	
Session 5. Linking with NARS 15.45 – 16.30	Linking regional programmes to National Systems	Harold Roy-Macauley, CORAF
	Discussion	
16.30 – 17.30	Panel Discussion How is CGIAR supporting key EU policy objectives of poverty reduction and food and nutrition security in developing countries?	Philippe Petithuguenin, CIRAD (moderator) Frank Rijsberman, Consortium Maggie Gill, ISPC Mark Holderness, GFAR Jonathan Wadsworth, Fund Office
17.30	Close	Bernard Rey, DEVCO